



May 29, 2002

Ms. Leah Simon
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2002-2867

Dear Ms. Simon:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 163563.

The Waco Police Department (the “department”) received a request for two specific reports and all incident reports regarding a named individual. You state that you will release a portion of the responsive information to the requestor. However, you claim that some of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code states that information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from required public disclosure “if release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). You inform us that the two offense reports specified in the request, offense report numbers 01-066110 and 01-069084, as well as offense report number 01-065814, pertain to pending cases. We therefore believe that the release of offense report numbers 01-066110, 01-069084, and 01-065814 “would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” *Id.*

However, section 552.108 is inapplicable to basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). We believe such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Company v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.--Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, with the exception of the basic offense and arrest information, you may withhold offense report numbers 01-066110, 01-069084, and

01-065814 from disclosure based on section 552.108(a)(1). We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of the remaining information that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov't Code § 552.007.

We now address the portion of the request that sought "all arrest reports or incident reports involving [a named individual.]" Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."¹ For information to be protected from public disclosure by the common-law right of privacy under section 552.101, the information must meet the criteria set out in *Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977). In *Industrial Foundation*, the Texas Supreme Court stated that information is excepted from disclosure if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the release of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. 540 S.W.2d at 685. Where an individual's criminal history information has been compiled by a governmental entity, the information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right to privacy. *See United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989). In this instance, the requestor asks for any information regarding a named individual. In this case, we believe that the individual's right to privacy has been implicated. Thus, where the named individual is a possible suspect, arrestee, or defendant, we conclude that you must withhold this information under common-law privacy as encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See id.*

You also claim that portions of the records identified in Exhibits 3 and 4 are excepted from disclosure under section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 552.101 also encompasses confidentiality provisions such as Family Code section 58.007. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007. The relevant language of section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.101 on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

The offense reports you have identified do not involve juvenile conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. Therefore, you may not withhold any of the reports in Exhibits 3 and 4 pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

In regard to the remainder of the submitted information, Exhibit 4, you have marked portions of the documents as excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Therefore, the department must withhold the Texas driver's license numbers, license plate numbers, and vehicle identification numbers you have marked pursuant to section 552.130.

You have also marked social security numbers as excepted from disclosure. We note that a social security number is excepted from required public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), *if it was obtained or is maintained by a governmental body pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. See Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994).* It is not apparent to us that the social security numbers contained in the records at issue were obtained or are maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. You have cited no law, nor are we aware of any law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990, that authorizes the department to obtain or maintain a social security number. Therefore, we have no basis for concluding that the social security numbers at issue were obtained or are maintained pursuant to such a statute and are, therefore, confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(vii)(I). We caution the department, however, that section 552.352 of the Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social

security numbers, the department should ensure that these numbers were not obtained or are maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

In summary, we conclude that: 1) with the exception of the basic offense and arrest information, you may withhold offense report numbers 01-066110, 01-069084, and 01-065814 from disclosure based on section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; 2) where the individual named in the request is a possible suspect, arrestee, or defendant, you must withhold this information under common-law privacy as encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code; 3) the department must withhold the Texas driver's license numbers, license plate numbers, and vehicle identification numbers you have marked pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code; and 4) the social security numbers you have marked may be excepted from required public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).


If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



W. Montgomery Meitler
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

WMM/sdk

Ref: ID# 163563

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Fernando Villarreal
3305 Robinson Drive, Suite B
Waco, Texas 76706
(w/o enclosures)